Labour Turnover and It Implications on Health Care Sector in Nigeria

By

Christopher Oyemwinmina
Institute of Public Administration and Health Services Management
University of Benin, Benin City.
Email: christopher.oyemwinmina@uniben.edu
Phone: 07056022224

&

Florence Oahimijie
Institute of Public Administration and Health Services Management
University of Benin, Benin City.
Email: florence.oahimijie@uniben.edu
Phone: 08158736056.

Abstract

This study aimed at the causes of employees labour turnover and the implications for the healthcare delivery in Nigeria. To achieve this objectives, the secondary source of date collection was employed, as relevant journals, textbooks were utilized. The study revealed factors responsible for the employees turnover in the Nigeria healthcare sector. Such as poor working conditions, poor staff motivation, irregular promotions, lack of training and development among others. It was therefore recommended that the government should ensure and improve the working conditions of the healthcare employees, staff training and development and improved total take-home pay amongst others.

Introduction

In the present competitive business world, the employees have become equally important to the organisations, if not more, as the customers that bring profits to the organisations. The need for skillful employees has become very crucial for organisations to operate successfully. The skilled and hardworking employees are like assets to the company, which the organization wants to retain for a longer period of time. The skilled workers give their level best to achieves the

organizational strategic goals with their hard work and dedication. (Cattermole, 2019)

Recently in Nigeria, there is a growing concern about the quality and quantity of healthcare personnel services. This has become a major concern of the world health organization (WHO), the common wealth and even human resources development experts. All over the world there exist a managerial problem of finding successful mechanism of retaining employees especially in a job environment that is characterized by constant yearnings for pay rise.

One of the most pressing needs in the developing country today is the development of healthcare personnel who are capable of identifying problems, planning and implementing practical solutions and evaluating their applications. In view of the dynamic changes that is taking place globally, the traditional organizational structure can no longer meet the need of the modern workers, especially in the healthcare establishment. This is because the world has become one global village in view of advancement in information technology and science which has brought a near explosion in the rate and magnitude of changes in our environment. These changes which are inevitable have brought both positive and negative effects on the present day quantum of life (Ukwandu, 2020).

Organisations do not want their employees to leave them and work anywhere else. The reason is that a well-trained and skillful employee is hard to find and replace in terms of cost and time. Yet employee tend to switch from organization to organization in order to fulfill their own needs, requirements or demands.

A careful analysis of the turnover in the organization can to a large extent suggests the quality of its human resources and the policy directed at keeping and enhancing its human quality labour is to a large extent determined by deliberate polices and tactics that has been put in place which is geared towards achieving set goals and objectives.

Job satisfaction has influence on employees turnover in the organisations. Job satisfaction is known to have positive impact in employee turnover intentions, just as dissatisfaction on the job increases the rate of employee turnover intention in

any organization. Dessler (1978) refers to job satisfaction as the degree of needs satisfaction that is derived from experienced on the job. Consequently, the inability of employees to achieve their needs amounts to dissatisfaction. Job satisfaction is the general attitude towards an individuals' job, and the difference between the amount of reward workers receive and the amount they believe they should receive. A person with a high level of job satisfaction holds positive attitude toward the job while the person who dissatisfied with the job holds negative attitude about the job (Pini, Safaris & Malliaro, 2014).

According to Phillips (2017), a high labour turnover is expensive in terms of loss of expertise, cost of training new employees, retaining existing staff to take up new responsibilities, temporary reduction in volume and quality of output and consequently low productivity. Job satisfaction leads job retention however, job dissatisfaction may not necessarily lead to labour turnover.

This organizational problem has assumed a dramatic turn for the worst in view of the population explosion and patronage of health care service that outweighs the available personnel, funds and materials. This rapidly population expansion and other forms of social vices have brought a great demand on healthcare needs. The healthcare needs and demand can only be met with the corresponding health provide s with the required skills and body of knowledge. Unfortunately, due to the mass exodus of healthcare employees from Nigeria, such skilled and well trained healthcare personnel are no easy to come by for now (Onu, Oriji, Aluh and Onyeka, 2021).

The Nigeria civil service has failed woefully to respond adequately to the dynamics of the labour market. The image of the professionals in the healthcare sector is not greatly poor image and low self-esteem of some hospital professional worker and the treatment of some professionals like nurses and a quasi-professional culminates in looking for better working environment s with a better pay, either in the oil sector or overseas countries.

In the light of the above, this paper decided to look at the factors that influence the employees decision to quit the place of work especially the Nigeria health sector, the effect and to proffer the necessary recommendations.

Theoretical Framework

Rational Choice Theory of Action

This theory articulate that people make choices about their actions through a cost-benefit analysis of sorts by comparing the cost or benefits of different courses of action. The theory effectively looks to two different driving forces. Which are beliefs and desires.

Philosopher Adam Smith is considered the originator of rational choice theory. In his essay "an inquiry into the nature and causes of wealth of nations" in 1776, He proposed human natures tendency toward self-interest resulting in prosperity. Rational choice theory states that individuals rely on rational calculations to make choice that result in outcomes aligned with their own best interest. The theory is associated with the concepts of rational actors, self-interest and invisible hand (Greenhaus and Callanan, 2012).

The theory states that individual have to make choice based on their goals and the means to attain said goals. Preferences are based on anticipated outcomes for each action. As rational actors, individuals will choose the course of action leading to the greatest result or satisfaction.

Rational action theory provides a basis for the explanation of an individuals' ability to make informed decision in a given situation. This theory assumes that individuals are independent in any decision-making process. It is a micro-theory which describes individuals as rational actors with abilities to act in different way in managing the constraints and opportunities that may face them.

Within the context, the ratio action theory, labour mobility could be described as a voluntary action based on the appreciation of some better chances for survival or self-advancement. Thus, in the light of labour mobility, workers can calculate rationally their chances and benefits within various sectors of modern organization. Some workers may decide to their jobs in cities at the expense of the work they might otherwise have pursued within their traditional occupations (Chavadi & Sirothiya, 2022).

In the Nigeria healthcare sector, labour turnover amongst healthcare professionals has become an epidemic with thousands of professionals in the industry, old and young, transferring their services to other countries especially the developed regions of Europe and north America for reasons related to economic, social and career considerations.

Types of Employee Turnover

The employee turnover is working phenomenon that can manifest itself in various ways. According to Michael (2024), there are five major types of employee turnover.

1. **Voluntary turnover**

This kind of turnover happens when employees make a voluntary decision to leave. They could be taking a new role somewhere else, or focusing on other parts of their life. It is voluntary when the choice of leaving the organisaction in initiated by the employee. Generally, human resource managers are always trying to reduce voluntary turnover, but its inevitable to some degree. Eventually, everyone will leave an either for voluntary or involuntary reasons.

2. **Involuntary turnover**

In the involuntary turnover, the employee has no choice in their termination. It may result from the following situations, dismissal, retrenchment/redundancy, retirement, long term sickness, physical/mental disability etc. this would be the case of the organization detecting that certain workers are not performing their duties adequately. They would be dismissed in order to incorporate e new talent into the workforce that does meet the expectations set. Low involuntary turnover is generally a good thing as there is nothing wrong with ending a situation that wasn't working out.

3. **Attrition**

Attrition is refers to instances where an employee leaves an organization whether voluntary or involuntary and the organization makes strategic decision to not fill the role again. Layoffs are one common type of attrition, caused by company restructuring, downsizing, or the elimination of projects and roles. There is a distinction between attrition and turnover as concepts. Turnover technically refers

to the rate at which employees leave organization and are replaced with a given period of time. Attrition, on the other hand, refers to instance where and employee leaves, whether voluntary or involuntary and the company make the strategic decision to not fill the role again.

4. **Regrettable turnover**

As the name implies, this is the most problematic kind of turnover. It means the organization is losing valuable, high performing employee that is someone they would have preferred to keep. Any organization is only as strong as its people. That is why reducing regrettable turnover and holding on to talent, should be a key priority for the human resource manager.

5. Internal turnover

Turnover is internal when employees leave their current assignment and take up new roles or positions within the organization. The human resource mechanism such as recruitment policy and succession planning can be used to control internal turnover. This kind of talent outcomes including profitability, innovation, and customer satisfaction. However, its possible for employee to seek out internal transfers for the same reasons they had wanted to leave.

Causes of Employee Turnover in an Organisation

When a key employee leaves the organization, it slow down the entire operation. Other employees have to work doubles, as they have to attend to their tasks and the tasks of the person who left some of the causes of the employee leaving their jobs as follows:

1. **Insufficient pay**

The most common reason why employees leave certain organization is for a better opportunity elsewhere (Roberts, 2017). Man has a growing desire to own more things and better pay to achieve this. In other word, they are compelled to look for better pay because of financial needs (Heneman & Judge, 2000).

In Nigeria over 1,000 and above medical doctors take the Hippocratic oaths and are only registered by the Dental and medical council of Nigeria annually while three thousand nurses are trained and registered yearly by the nursing and

midwifery council of Nigeria, yet there are shortages of qualified medical doctors and registered nurses to effectively man our health institutions in Nigeria due to the insufficient salary compared to their counterpart in the developed countries.

2. **Lack of Professional Development**

Staff development is concerned with an improvement and growth of abilities, attitudes and personality traits. It is the responsibility of the human resources department in an organization to see that the staff are trained, retrained on the job developed. Training and development ought be a continuous process throughout the tenure of the staff on the job.

It is normal for employee to seek professional growth. It is also normal that at a certain point in time their current job no longer allows them to develop more than the already have. This lack of projection and development may lead the employee to look for more exciting challenges in another organization.

3. Lack of Recognition

When employee feels that their work is not recognised or valued by the members of their company, they begin to lose their commitment to the organization. They also begin to look for places where their work is recognised.

4. Job Satisfaction

An unsatisfactory work is a hotbed of turnover lack support, constant, instability, lack of communication, workload are often the most common causes of dissatisfaction and this motivates employees to look for a better workplace (Mchugh & Ma, 2013).

An essential factor in an organization is job satisfaction. There are three factors of job satisfaction that affect employee turnover, namely satisfaction with pay, satisfaction with nature of work, and satisfaction with supervision (Pan Casila el al, 2020).

Pay is considered one of the most important factors influencing employee turnover in Nigeria. The reason are high inflation in the economy which has adverse effect on the cost of living and extended family dependency. Culturally,

much is expected from average worker, in terms of financial support to both his immediate and extended family as well as personal crave and societal recognition for monetary success. Pay and pay related variables have modest effect on turnover.

The nature of work in Nigeria is also an important consideration because of the higher educational level and the level of affluence of Nigerians. Past generation of employees were basically school leaves who did not care much about the kind of work they were doing. They joined organisations and rose through the ranks and hardly left since they were no educated. Satisfaction with the nature of work is negatively associated with the turnover.

Supervision poor interpersonal skills and who is also inflexible, very quickly drives employees away. Also, unclear expectations of supervisors, ambiguity of performance evaluation methods, extensive job pressures, and lack of consensus on job functions or duties may cause employees to feel less involved and less satisfied with their jobs and careers, less commitment to the their organization, and eventually display a propensity to leave the organization.

5. Performance Problems

This happens when an employee does not meet the organization performance expectations. In this cases the organization usually decides to terminate the employment relationship in order to preserve work quality standards.

6. Organizational Restructuring

Changes in organization structure or strategy may result in the elimination or strategy may result in the elimination or change of jobs. This may result in the need for different skills, resulting in the dismissal of some employees.

Effect of Employees Turnover on Organisation

Employee turnover is a major concern that every organization, regardless of public or private. It is becomes a regular occurrence, it can have serious consequences to the organization (Armstrong & Taylor, 2014). When employee turnover rate is high, its effect will be rippled by reduced productivity and increased time spent

in recruiting, training and onboarding new employee. It can also lead to a decrease in employee morale, which negatively impacts organisations reputation.

Some of the employees turnover are as followed:

i. Financial loss / Operational cost

Losing valuable employee is not only a setback with time and money used in the employment procedures, recruitment, selection, orientation, inductions, training and employment development but it may also affect the revenue generated by the organization (Paawe & Boon, 2018). Because some relationship cultivated between the employee and some clients, some clients may follow the leaving employee to the new organization. That amount to reduction of fund for the establishment.

The situation become worsen if there is no immediate suitable replacement to take over the departing employees responsibilities. In this case, high turnover rates affect the organization ability to generate revenue. Excessive employee turnover and mobility are wasteful in money, human values and frictions within and between work-terms and also jeopardize organizational health and productivity when the demand for a class of labour far outweigh the supply because of turnover rate, it grossly affect the total output of such an organization.

The financial burden of turnover extends beyond immediate hiring cost (Famdale et al 2018). In health care, the need for ongoing training to meet regulatory compliance adds to expenses, such as the potential for increased overtime pay to cover shifts left vacant by departing staff.

ii. Recruitment Difficulty

People generally make assumptions about organization with high turnover. High turnover can harm organization reputation which is crucial when it comes to attracting top talent. The constant need to recruit and on board new hires can strain and prolong the time it takes to fill the vacancies. When any organization is perceived as a revolving door, it may be difficult for the Human Resource Department to attract qualified candidates as potential employees may hesitate to apply, which worsen the issue.

iii. Lower Quality of Work

This can be one of the negative impacts of employee turnover. If the turnover rate is high, either the company keeps functioning with a lower number of employees or with a portion of inexperienced employees that don't have proper training. It can result in low quality work and low productivity (Febrainti & Seo, 2020).

The quality of healthcare is directly influenced by staff experience (Mcgilton & Boscart, 2007). When nurses and physician leave, their knowledge of patient histories, treatment protocols, and organizational culture is lost. This actually lead to errors in medication administration and inadequate patient assessment. And also the new hired employee takes time to build rapport with the patient.

iv. Decrease in Productivity

Although some departures are unavoidable but losing a large of experienced employee due to voluntary turnover can have a ripple effect on the organization. The exit of seasoned employees impacts productivity across the organization, especially when vacancies cannot be filled as quickly as possible. When key employees leave, their responsibilities are usually transferred to someone else, this result to burden on existing. The remaining employees may become over whelmed with an increased workload, which can raise stress levels and lead to under satisfactory work.

This can add to the difficulties of employee turnover, as the some employees struggles to dodge the increased workload by manifesting various reaction of resistance which backseat the organizational productivity.

v. Low Morale

High employees turnover can make the existing employees feel overworked and burn out there by creating a cycle of disengagement and attrition. Existing employees may be given additional responsibilities until new employees are hired and up to speed, this amplifies the downward spiral of poor morale and employees wanting to quit. When this happens, the employee who is left behind typically becomes distracted, inattentive, and suggesting whether they should look for a new job themselves.

According to Chavati & Sirothiya, (2022) high turnover often creates a stressful environment for remaining employees, who may feel overburdened by additional responsibilities. This can lead to a decrease in job satisfaction and an increase in absenteeism.

vi. Patients satisfaction

In the situation, where patients encounters a revolving door of healthcare workers, the trust and confidence of the employee can be eroded thereby leading to decreased satisfaction. According to Ihsani & Wijayanto (2020), in public sectors, citizens may feel neglected or undervalued if they perceive a lack of continuity in service delivery. This also damage in the health sectors

Conclusion

A certain amount of mobility is inevitable in organisations, factors like illness, accidents, aging, death and a variety of personal reasons bring about migration and separation from the organization. Though some degree of mobility is both inevitable and healthy for the organization, too much of it reduces organizational productivity, demoralizes, incumbents and damage the organization public image. This means that the employees who are satisfied in their job will always retain their job and avoid quitting. Therefore increase in job satisfaction will led to the decrease in employee turnover.

Recommendations

This paper hereby recommend the following to reduce the labour turnover in the Nigeria health sector:

1. The salary structures in the public health institutions should be structured along with their professional colleagues in other countries.
2. Promotion should be transparent and done on regular basis, for all the healthcare staff, following the laid down rules and regulations.
3. Communication, transparency and trust are critical to reducing voluntary turnover. Effective communication between management and staff should be encourage in the healthcare organization. This should be in form of meeting, seminars, workshops, circular etc. to avoid rumors and rancor.

4. A deliberate training and retraining programme should be put in place for effective and efficient performance of the healthcare employees and also to take advantage of evolving trends due to advancement in technology.
5. Basic infrastructure, modern equipment and instruments should be provided and made available for the smooth working of the healthcare employees.
6. Adequate provisions should be made to improve the working environments. The working environment should be such that there is job satisfaction.
7. Employees should be engaged to play a crucial role and perform at a higher level and contribute positively to the workplace culture. Employee engagement plays a crucial role in reducing high turnover.
8. Organization should occasionally organize interactive programmes to find out the frustration the employees are experiencing. In order to enhance a workplace satisfaction.
9. The orgnaisation should create new incentives that will make the workplace a more ideal place to work.

Reference

Armstrong, M., Taylor, S. (2014). *Employee turnover. Hand book of Human Resource Management Practice.* London: Kogan Page ltd.

Cattermole, G. (2019). Developing the Employee life cycle to keep to talent. *Strategic HR review 18 (6) 258-262*

Chavadi, C. A. & Sirothiya, V. (2022). Mediating role of job satisfaction on turnover intentions and job mismatch among millennial employee in Bengluru. *Business perspectives and Research 10(1), 79-100*

Famdale, E., Nikandrou, R., Panayotopoulou, L. (2018). *Recruitment and selection in context. Handbook of research on comparative human resource management. England:* EdwardEigar Publishing.

Febrianti, N. T and SEO, S (2020). The effect of career development and motivation of employee. *International journal of business and social science research 1(2) 1-12.*

Greenhaus, J. H. & Callanan, G.A (2012). *Career management*. UK: Sage Publication.

Heneman, H. G. & Judge, T.A (2000). The effects of pay on job satisfaction: *A meta-analysis. Personnel psychology 53(3)757-787*

Ihsani, N., and Wijayanto, A (2020). The effect oragnisational culture, motivation and job satisfaction on employee performance. *International journal of digital business management 1(4), 492-502.*

Mc Hugh, M.D., & Ma, C. (2013). Relationship between Nurse reports of adequate staffing and patient satisfaction. *Journal of Nursing Administration, 43(2), 107-112*

Mcgilton, K. S. & Boscart, V.M (2007). "The impact of Nurse Turnover on patient care". *Nursing leadership, 20(3)19-28*

Onu, J. U., Oriji., Aluh, D. O. and Onyeka, T.C (2021). Aftermath of Covid-19: forestalling irreparable medical brain drain in sub-saharam Africa. *Journal of Health care 3(4).*

Paauwe, J, and Boon, C. (2018). *Strategic human resource management*. London: Routledge.

Pancasila, I, Haryono, S., and Sulistyo, B.A (2020). Effect of work motivation and leadership toward work satisfaction and employee performance. *Journal of Asian finance, economics and business. 7(6) 387-397*

Phillips, C. (2017). *Investment opportunities in Nigerian health industry.* Lagos: Phillips consulting.

Pini, A., Sarafis, P. and Malliarou, M. (2014). Assessment of patient satisfaction of the quality of healthcare provided by outpatient services. *Global journal of health science. 6(5) 10-22*

Roberts, S. J (2017). Workplace culture and employee retention: An overview. *Journal of organizational behavior. 38(5). 779-796*

Ukwandu, D. (2020). Sub-Saharam Africa's policy response to the challenges of development and good governance. *African Renaissance, 17(1) 56-68*